

THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO. 9

**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

DIVISION: Sustainable Streets

BRIEF DESCRIPTION:

Authorizing the Executive Director/CEO to negotiate and finalize agreements with the three highest ranking proposers for solicitation #SFMTA 2008/09-30 titled "Request for Proposals for Operation and Management of Parking Facilities."

SUMMARY:

- On April 4, 2009, the SFMTA Board of Directors approved advertising a Request for Proposals (RFP) soliciting proposals from qualified parking facility management firms to provide daily operation and management services for 14 parking facilities managed by the SFMTA.
- Subsequently, the RFP was released and 13 proposals were received by the proposal due date: five proposals for the facilities designated as Group A, five proposals for the facilities designated as Group B and three proposals for the facilities designated as Group C.
- Eleven of the 13 proposals were deemed responsive. A panel comprised of staff from various City and SFMTA departments reviewed the proposals, interviewed all operators and ranked them.
- Staff recommends awarding three contracts to the three highest ranking firms: Group A to ImCo LLC, Group B to Five Star Parking and Group C to Pacific Park Management.

ENCLOSURES:

1. SFMTA Board Resolution

APPROVALS:

DATE

DIRECTOR OF DIVISION
PREPARING ITEM

FINANCE

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR/CEO

SECRETARY

ADOPTED RESOLUTION
BE RETURNED TO:

Amit Kothari

ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE: _____

PAGE 2.

PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to provide results of solicitation #SFMTA 2008/09-30 titled “Request for Proposals for Operation and Management of Parking Facilities” and to seek authorization for the Executive Director/CEO to negotiate and finalize agreements with the three highest ranking proposers. The final agreements will be presented to the SFMTA Board for its approval in April 2010.

GOAL

This action is consistent with the SFMTA 2008-2012 Strategic Plan.

- Goal 2:** System Performance – To get customers where they want to go, when they want to be there
Objective 2.5: Manage parking supply to align with SFMTA and community goals

- Goal 3:** External Affairs/Community Relations – To improve the customer experience, community value, and enhance the image of the SFMTA, as well as ensure SFMTA is the leader in the industry
Objective 3.1: Improve economic vitality by growing relationships with businesses, community, and stakeholder groups

- Goal 4:** Financial Capacity – To ensure financial stability and effective resource utilization
Objective 4.1: Increase revenue by 20% or more by 2012 by improving collections and identifying new sources
Objective 4.2: Ensure efficient and effective use of resources

DESCRIPTION

The SFMTA’s Off-Street Parking Section manages 40 parking facilities, generating over \$85 million in gross revenue annually. The mission of the Off-Street Parking Section is to provide clean, safe and convenient parking to the visitors, employees and businesses in the downtown core, as well as to the commercial and residential districts. Through effective management of over 15,000 spaces at these facilities, the Off-Street Parking Section supports economic vitality in the City’s downtown and neighborhood commercial districts.

In April 2009, after extensive operator outreach and participation, an RFP was advertised soliciting proposals from qualified parking operators to operate and manage 14 parking facilities. To achieve the highest operational efficiencies, oversight and opportunities for enhanced small/local business participation and joint venturing, these facilities were divided into the following three groups:

Group A (6 facilities - 3,316 spaces)

- | | |
|---------------------|------------------------|
| Civic Center Garage | Golden Gateway Garage |
| North Beach Garage | Performing Arts Garage |
| St. Mary’s Garage | Vallejo Street Garage |

Group B (4 facilities – 2,944 spaces)

- | | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------|
| Lombard Street Garage | Mission Bartlett Garage |
| Moscone Center Garage | S.F. General Hospital Garage |

PAGE 3.

Group C (4 facilities - 387 spaces)

Polk Bush Garage	16 th & Hoff Garage
1660 Mission Street Garage	7 th & Harrison Lot

Group C was specifically created to provide additional opportunities for firms with limited resources and/or parking experience.

Under the terms of the RFP, a proposer could submit a proposal for the management of one, two, or all three groups, but could only be awarded a contract for one group. Six firms submitted a total of 13 proposals for the three groups. Eleven of the 13 proposals met all city requirements and were deemed responsive. A panel comprised of staff from the Controller’s Office, the San Francisco International Airport, and the SFMTA (Finance, Rail Operations and Off-Street Parking) reviewed the proposals, interviewed all proposers and ranked them using the following criteria identified in the RFP:

CRITERIA	MAXIMUM POINTS
1. Written Proposal	150
a. Qualifications and Experience	30
b. Management Approach: Staffing/Operational Plan/Budget	50
c. Maintenance Plan	20
d. Marketing Plan	15
e. Security and Safety Plan	15
f. Overall organization and clarity of proposal	20
2. Oral Interview/Presentation	50
TOTAL	200

The panel members individually reviewed each proposal, followed by joint meetings where the strengths and weaknesses of each proposal were discussed. Interviews were held with each proposer that provided additional information and necessary clarifications on their respective proposals. The firm ranking and winner of each Group are discussed in the following sections.

Group A

The following table shows the point-score received by each proposer for their written proposals and oral interviews for Group A. The firms are ranked based on the total score received.

RANK	PROPOSER	WRITTEN SCORE	ORAL SCORE	TOTAL SCORE
1	ImCo LLC	124.9	45.0	170.0
2	Five Star Parking	119.6	35.4	155.0
3	Imperial Parking	112.2	41.4	153.6
4	Pacific Park Management	104.6	28.4	133.0

PAGE 4.

Staff recommends awarding Group A facilities to the joint venture firm ImCo, LLC. If approved by the SFMTA Board, ImCo, LLC will assume management responsibilities for all six facilities in Group A, effective May 1, 2010. A 25 percent Local Business Enterprise (LBE) participation was required. All proposers met this requirement. Additionally, ImCo LLC is a joint-venture between Imperial Parking and Convenient Parking, a LBE firm.

Group B

The following table shows the point-score received by each proposer for their written proposals and oral interviews for Group B. The firms are ranked based on the total score received.

RANK	PROPOSER	WRITTEN SCORE	ORAL SCORE	TOTAL SCORE
1	ImCo LLC	114.2	45.0	159.2
2	Five Star Parking	119.6	35.4	155.0
3	Imperial Parking	103.6	41.4	145.0
4	Pacific Park Management	102.2	28.4	130.6

The RFP clearly indicated that a proposer can be awarded only one of the three Groups. Therefore, ImCo, LLC is not eligible for the Group B award. Staff recommends awarding Group B facilities to the next highest ranked proposer, Five Star Parking. As outlined in the RFP document, if approved by the SFMTA Board, Five Star will assume management responsibilities for the four facilities in Group B as shown below:

Name of Garage	Effective Date
Moscone Center	May 1, 2010
Lombard Street	October 1, 2011
SF General Hospital	January 1, 2012
Mission Bartlett	March 1, 2012

These dates are based on the expiration of existing contracts with current operators. A 25 percent Local Business Enterprise (LBE) participation was required. All proposers met this requirement.

Group C

The following table shows the point-score received by each proposer for their written proposals and oral interviews for Group C. The firms are ranked based on the total score received.

RANK	PROPOSER	WRITTEN SCORE	ORAL SCORE	TOTAL SCORE
1	Five Star Parking	109.4	35.4	144.8
2	Pacific Park Management	98.4	28.4	126.8
3	Convenient Parking	89.5	26.2	115.7

Since Five Star Parking is ineligible for the Group C award, staff recommends awarding Group C facilities to the next highest ranked proposer, Pacific Park Management (PPM). PPM will assume management responsibilities for four facilities in Group C as shown below:

Name of Garage	Effective Date
7 th /Harrison	May 1, 2010
16 th /Hoff	May 1, 2010
Polk Bush	June 1, 2010
1660 Mission	October 1, 2011

PAGE 5.

These dates are based on the expiration of existing contracts with current operators. A 15 percent Local Business Enterprise (LBE) participation was required. All proposers met this requirement.

If approved by the SFMTA Board, staff will negotiate and finalize agreements for the three groups within the parameters of the RFP. The above discussion assumes that SFMTA will be able to reach agreement with each of the highest ranked proposers. As noted in the RFP, if SFMTA is unable to reach agreement with such a proposer, staff will enter into negotiations with the next highest-ranked eligible proposer. The final agreements will be presented to the Board for its approval in April 2010.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

In January 2010, the Controller requested that the Agency hold off awarding any long-term facility management contracts while the Controller's Office evaluates the possibility of a long-term concession agreement for the City's parking facilities. Staff considered this request, although it would require awarding short-term contracts for several facilities with expired contracts. In lieu of awarding several new, short-term contracts, staff recommends awarding long-term contracts that include appropriate language in the management agreements allowing early termination if necessary.

FUNDING IMPACT

The adopted budget for FY2010 and proposed budgets for FY2011 and FY2012 include adequate funds for these agreements.

OTHER APPROVALS RECEIVED OR STILL REQUIRED

Approval by the Civil Services Commission on a Personal Services Contract (PSC) is anticipated in March. The final agreements will require approval by the Parking Authority Commission.

The City Attorney's Office has reviewed this item.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the SFMTA Board of Directors authorizes the Executive Director/CEO, or his designee, to negotiate and finalize the agreements for the management of the parking facilities designated as Groups A, B and C in solicitation # SFMTA 2008/9-30 for final approval by the SFMTA Board and the Parking Authority Commission.

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. _____

WHEREAS, The mission of the Off-Street Parking Section is to provide clean, safe and convenient parking to the visitors, employees and businesses in the downtown core, as well as to the commercial and residential districts; and

WHEREAS, Through effective management of over 15,000 spaces at 40 parking facilities, the Off-Street Parking Section supports economic vitality in the City's downtown and neighborhood commercial districts, supports the City's *Transit First* policy, develops various parking policies and programs that help reduce traffic congestion on City streets and promote alternate modes of transportation; and

WHEREAS, In April 2009, the SFMTA advertised solicitation #SFMTA 2008/09-30 titled "Request for Proposals for Operation and Management of Parking Facilities" (the RFP), soliciting proposals from qualified parking operators to manage 14 off-street parking facilities divided into three groups; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA received proposals from six parking operators, resulting in a total of 13 proposals for the three groups of facilities; and

WHEREAS, A panel comprised of staff from the Controller's Office, the San Francisco International Airport and three SFMTA divisions evaluated the eleven responsive proposals and interviewed each firm; and

WHEREAS, Based on the panel rankings, staff recommends awarding facility management awards to the three highest ranking firms - Group A to ImCo LLC, Group B to Five Star Parking and Group C to Pacific Park Management; now therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the SFMTA Board of Directors authorizes the Executive Director/CEO, or his designee, to negotiate and finalize the agreements for the management of the parking facilities designated as Groups A, B and C in solicitation # SFMTA 2008/9-30 for final approval by the SFMTA Board and the Parking Authority Commission.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of _____.

Secretary to the Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency