On Time Performance

PRESENTATION TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
Sept 24, 2007

Presented by
Kenneth Mc Donald - COO
Sonali Bose - CFO
Purpose

To respond to the Board’s request on the range of resources and timeline required to meet the Proposition E on-time performance and service goals.

To provide background data and information related to the Proposition E goals.
Proposition E

• Section 8A.103
  – On-time performance: at least 85 percent of vehicles must run on-time, (on-time is no more than one minute early or four minutes late)
  – Service delivery:
    • 98.5 percent of scheduled service hours must be delivered
    • At least 98.5 percent scheduled vehicles must begin service at the scheduled time
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SFMTA San Francisco</th>
<th>NYCT New York City</th>
<th>MBTA Boston</th>
<th>CTA Chicago</th>
<th>LACMTA Los Angeles</th>
<th>SEPTA Philadelphia</th>
<th>WMATA Washington, DC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Area</strong> (square miles)</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>320</td>
<td><strong>3,240</strong></td>
<td>360</td>
<td>1,220</td>
<td>840</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Density</strong> (persons per square mile)</td>
<td>16,200</td>
<td><strong>25,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,400</strong></td>
<td>10,300</td>
<td>7,000</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>1,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transit Density</strong> (vehicle revenue-hours per square mile)</td>
<td>66,800</td>
<td><strong>99,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,400</strong></td>
<td>28,400</td>
<td>5,900</td>
<td>6,700</td>
<td>8,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Usage</strong> (unlinked passenger trips per capita)</td>
<td>272</td>
<td><strong>331</strong></td>
<td><strong>86</strong></td>
<td>127</td>
<td><strong>46</strong></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Speed (mph)</strong></td>
<td><strong>8.1</strong></td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td><strong>16.9</strong></td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>16.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Productivity</strong> (unlinked passenger trips per vehicle revenue hour)</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>84</td>
<td><strong>88</strong></td>
<td>46</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost Efficiency</strong> (operating cost per vehicle revenue hour)</td>
<td><strong>$132</strong></td>
<td><strong>$133</strong></td>
<td><strong>$183</strong></td>
<td><strong>$105</strong></td>
<td><strong>$124</strong></td>
<td><strong>$134</strong></td>
<td><strong>$160</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost Effectiveness</strong> (operating cost per passenger trip)</td>
<td><strong>$2.00</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1.59</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.08</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.26</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.27</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.29</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2.32</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** National Transit Database
Muni has the lowest monthly pass fare and the lowest system fare.
## LOCAL PEER FARE INFORMATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>System Adult Fare</th>
<th>Monthly Pass</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SFMTA</td>
<td>$1.50</td>
<td>$45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SamTrans</td>
<td>$1.50</td>
<td>$48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Gate</td>
<td>$3.00-$8.00</td>
<td>No monthly pass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTA</td>
<td>$1.75</td>
<td>$61.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BART</td>
<td>$1.40-$7.45</td>
<td>No monthly pass</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Peer Fare Recovery

Study by LACMTA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transit Agency</th>
<th>Modes</th>
<th>Fare Recovery Rate</th>
<th>Average Fare per Boarding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYCT (New York City)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>59.20%</td>
<td>$0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBTA (Boston)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>28.90%</td>
<td>$0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTA (Chicago)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>45.20%</td>
<td>$0.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LACMTA (Los Angeles)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>24.70%</td>
<td>$0.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPTA (Philadelphia)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>40.00%</td>
<td>$0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMATA (Wash., DC)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>40.80%</td>
<td>$1.06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Local (Source: MTC)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transit Agency</th>
<th>Modes</th>
<th>Fare Recovery Rate</th>
<th>Average Fare per Boarding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SFMTA (San Francisco)</td>
<td>Bus &amp; Rail</td>
<td>25.2%</td>
<td>$0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AC Transit (East Bay)</td>
<td>Bus</td>
<td>19.70%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BART</td>
<td>Rail</td>
<td>59.09</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SamTrans</td>
<td>Bus</td>
<td>17.50%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Gate</td>
<td>Bus, Ferry</td>
<td>26.94%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTA</td>
<td>Bus, Rail</td>
<td>11.74%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Peer - On Time Performance

SFMTA: 70.1% system wide
1 min early to 4 min late

NYMTA: 68.9% bus
5 min early to 5 min late

CTA: 78.1% bus
1 min early to 5 min late

LACMTA: 68-71% bus
1 min early to 5 min late

WMATA: 1 min early to 5 min late
Factors Affecting Muni’s On Time Performance

**Demographics and Environment**
Traffic, Population, Density, Topography, Speed

**Operating Environment**
Number of stops, Modes, Obsolete technology and infrastructure, Higher than average requirements for technology, infrastructure and maintenance

**Governance**
City Department, Unfunded voter-mandated performance standards, Multiple Policy Bodies, Sales Tax distributed through another Agency for capital projects

**Financial Issues**
Structural deficit, Complex Fare Media and Collection, Budgets have not increased as Transit First policy evolved, Limited dedicated funding, Fare Policy (rate increases)
Requirements To Improve Muni’s On Time Performance – Capital and Equipment

• Central Control Center, Radio System, NextMuni
• Maintenance and Repair Facilities
• Vehicle Storage Yards
• Fare Collection System
• Vehicle Replacement program – revenue and non revenue
• Vehicle Rehabilitation program – bus and rail
• Track and Overhead Lines In Good State of Repair (power)
• Dedicated Bus Lanes
• Expanded Street Enforcement
• Signal Prioritization
Requirements To Improve Muni’s On Time Performance - Processes

- Expanded Training
- Safety Enhancements
- Information and Transportation Management Systems
- Inventory and Procurement Best Practices
- Analytical Tools to aid in Management Decisions
- Operational Policies and Procedures, SOP’s
- Implement TEP recommendations
- Adequate Funding
Requirements To Improve Muni’s On Time Performance – Direct Staffing Needs

• **Schedule**
  – Schedulers
  – Estimators
  – Dispatchers

• **Vehicles**
  – Mechanics
  – Electricians
  – Automotive Repairers
  – Painters
  – Vehicle Cleaners

• **Operators**

• **Street Supervision**
  – Street Supervisors
  – Safety Personnel

• **Transit Route Congestion Management**
  – PCO dedicated to transit routes
  – Sign installers
  – Traffic Engineers
  – Signal Technicians
  – Power Technicians
  – Paint Shop staff
Requirements To Improve Muni’s On Time Performance – Support Personnel

Proof of Payment inspectors
Project Managers
Parking Meter Shop Repairers
Sign Installers
Grants Procurement
Contract Administrators
Capital Program Analysts
Supervisors and Managers
Fare Media
Budget and Accounting
Station Agents
Administrative Analysts
Marketing and Communications Staff

Engineers
Program Managers
Real Estate and Property Managers
Signal Technicians
Operations Support
Transportation Planners
Construction Inspectors
Revenue Collection
Human Resources Staff
Information Technology Staff
Public Relations Officers
Clerical Staff
Projected Funding Requirement

– Fiscal Year 2008 operating funded budget $668.3 million

– New unfunded operating requests by divisions during the FY 2007-2008 budget process was $78 million to include over 430 new positions (60 existing positions realigned)

– We are projecting that approximately $90 million in additional operating expenses would be required to reach 80% OTP and $150 million to reach 85% OTP
Conclusion

• Reaching Proposition E On Time Performance Goal and Service Standards are Possible

• Additional resources are required

• Resources and Initiatives must be phased in over five years for maximum effectiveness