

## TWU LOCAL 250-A OPERATORS (9163) LABOR COST ANALYSIS

Effective July 1, 2011

ROW	CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE	FY2011-2012	FY2012-2013	FY2013-2014	TOTAL
<b>SCHEDULING</b>					
1	Pay to Platform A <sup>1</sup> Reduce full time operator scheduled overtime pay and non-productive standby pay by employing part time operators for peak periods, weekends, and special runs.	(1,771,409)	(3,543,637)	(6,598,497)	(11,913,543)
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Related training for part time operators</li> </ul>	<u>1,895,863</u>	<u>1,654,684</u>	<u>2,082,750</u>	<u>5,631,297</u>
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Net Savings after increased training costs</li> </ul>	124,454	(1,888,953)	(4,515,747)	(6,282,246)
4	Pay To Platform B: Create more efficient and effective schedules (1%/4%/5% annual increments)	(1,334,704)	(5,388,815)	(6,673,519)	(13,347,038)
5	Pay rail premium at \$15.67 per run instead of extending run by 32 non-productive minutes paid at overtime rate (Paying at Straight time instead of OT)	(482,245)	(482,245)	(482,245)	(1,446,735)
6	Eliminate payments for cable car grips for 20-minute turn-in time	(263,983)	(263,983)	(263,983)	(791,949)
7	Eliminate payment for pulling out of one division and pulling into another division	(325,576)	(325,576)	(325,576)	(976,728)
8	Enable SFMTA to assign available extra board operators to fill special runs after all full time shift				

<sup>1</sup> Pay to platform ratio is a standard transit metric that compares an agency's operator's scheduled pay time to actual driving time. A high ratio indicates that a substantial overtime and/or standby time and a low ratio indicates that most paid time is used for active driving or operations. According to the May 2010 City Legislative and Budget Analyst's Report, SFMTA's ratio was the highest of comparable transit agencies at 1.23.

ROW	CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE	FY2011-2012	FY2012-2013	FY2013-2014	TOTAL
	vacancies are filled.	(143,051)	(143, 051)	(143,051)	(429,153)
9	Reduce General Sign-Ups/Bids from every year to every two years	(253,357)	(1,648,394)	(253,357)	(2,155,108)
10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Eliminate required negotiations and possible interest arbitration prior to implementing each bid</li> <li>• Management determines the number of extra board operators for each division</li> <li>• Management can change operators assignments between bids and when equipment fails</li> <li>• Eliminate requirement to hire more full time operators when “force totals” fall below set number</li> </ul>	Modified contract language permits SFMTA to provide reliable and efficient service. The savings depend on successful implementation over a period of years.			
11	<b>Subtotal</b>				(25,428,957)

ROW	CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE	FY2011-2012	FY2012-2013	FY2013-2014	TOTAL
<b>DISCIPLINE AND GRIEVANCE</b>					
12	Eliminate elaborate Passenger Service Reports procedure	Cost reductions depend on successful implementation and reduced staff time. Savings may vary over a period of years.			
13	Only suspension and termination are grievable; reprimands, warnings, caution and reinstruct forms of progressive discipline will no longer be grievable; should result in reduced staff and arbitrator expenses.	Cost reductions depend on successful implementation and reduced staff time. Savings may vary over a period of years.			
14	Eliminate Accident Review Board A: Eliminate ARB Staff time	(54,110)	(54,110)	(54,110)	(162,330)
15	Accident Review Board B: Five percent anticipated reduction in claims and workers compensation	(2,080,645)	(2,080,645)	(2,080,645)	(6,241,935)
16	Add annual customer service training for operators	434,766	434,766	434,766	1,304,298
17	For recommended terminations, remove operator from paid status at Grievance Step 2	(1,180,453)	(1,180,453)	(1,180,453)	(3,541,359)
18	<b>Subtotal</b>				(8,641,326)

ROW	CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE	FY2011-2012	FY2012-2013	FY2013-2014	TOTAL
<b>WAGES, PENSION, HEALTH/DENTAL BENEFITS</b>					
19	WAGES: Wage Freeze for three years	SFMTA will save \$4.6 million over three years in salary increases that would have been given to the operators had Proposition G not been implemented. This Proposition G savings is not included into the total amount on this comparison chart. <sup>2</sup>			
20	HEALTH: Cap SFMTA contribution for dependent coverage amounting to only four percent expected cost increase. <sup>3</sup>	0	(653,055)	(1,384,318)	(2,037,373)
21	DENTAL: Cap SFMTA contribution for dependent coverage at amount reflecting only four percent cost increase by Prop G if agreement is not reached.	(257,014)	(257,014)	(257,014)	(771,042)
22	PENSION A: For new hires, cap SFMTA's payment of employees' contribution at 2.5% of pay, down from 7.5% for 240 new hires per year.	(684,915)	(610,022)	(540,216)	(1,835,153)
23	<b>Subtotal</b>				<sup>4</sup> (4,643,568)

<sup>2</sup> This figure is based on \$.28 increase on FY 2012 base hourly wage which is the average of the two transit agencies with the highest operator hourly wage.

<sup>3</sup> These savings are computed against an eight percent projected increase by HSS and could be higher or lower depending on the actual increase.

ROW	CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE	FY2011-2012	FY2012-2013	FY2013-2014	TOTAL
<b>PAY PRACTICES</b>					
24	Calculation of Regular Day Off Overtime: Do not include vacation and sick leave used in calculating overtime eligibility	(430,000)	(430,000)	430,000	(1,290,000)
25	Reduce Line Trainer Premium	(7,224)	(7,224)	(7,224)	(21,672)
26	Delete Operator of the Month payments	(60,600)	(60,600)	(60,600)	(181,800)
27	Clarify progression on salary schedule	(62,680)	(62,680)	(62,680)	(188,040)
28	Calculate premium pay on base wage only	(261,605)	(261,605)	(261,605)	(784,815)
29	Eliminate attendance incentive	(38,411)	(38,411)	(38,411)	(115,233)
30	Modify eligibility for Expert Operator Premium	(268,777)	(268,777)	(268,777)	(806,331)
31	Standardize 15-minute report time increase from 10-minutes for rubber tire operators	349,966	349,966	349,966	1,049,898
32	<b>Subtotal</b>				(2,337,992)

<b>ROW</b>	<b>CONTRACT OR PRACTICE CHANGE</b>	<b>FY2011-2012</b>	<b>FY2012-2013</b>	<b>FY2013-2014</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
<b>UNION RELEASE TIME</b>					
33	Enhanced Joint Labor Management Committees to include three specific purposes	(200,000)	(200,000)	(200,000)	(600,000)
34	Union Chairpersons paid for 10 hours straight time and drive 5 hours per working day	261,397	261,397	261,397	784,191
35	Appendix D: Parking Operators pay for parking. (Potrero Upper Yard)	(880)	(880)	(880)	(2,640)
36	Peer Assistance Program (Two operators on release to aid with Employee Assistance Program)	(100,000)	(100,000)	(100,000)	(300,000)
37	<b>Subtotal</b>				(118,449)
38	<b>Total Savings</b>				<b>(41,170,292)</b>